COMPARATIVE STUDY OF DIFFERENT CULTIVARS OF LETTUCES IN UNHEATED POLYETHYLENE GREENHOUSE DURING WINTER-SPRING PERIOD

Milena Yordanova, Zhelyu Avramov, Nidal Shaban

University of Forestry, Faculty of Agronomy, 10 Kliment Ohridski Blvd, 1797, Sofia, Bulgaria

Corresponding author email: yordanova_m@yahoo.com

Abstract

The aim of our study was to test some varieties of lettuce in unheated greenhouse (high tunnel) for the winter growing with November transplanting. The experiment was carried out in the period 2015-2016 in the experimental field on University of Forestry - Sofia (42° 7' N, 23° 43' E). Were selected 19 cultivars (16 Batavia and 3 Lollo types) with different requirements for the terms and conditions of cultivation. The seedlings were planted on the block method with four replications in the second ten days of November in polyethylene greenhouse. Until the time of harvesting, four surveys have been made on the percentage of rooted and dead plants. During the harvesting of production (second ten days of March - early April) were made biometric measurements (diameter and average weight per plant). Several cultivars for winter indoor cultivation were highlighted: 6 from Batavia, all of Lollo, and two from Batavia for outdoor. Regardless of recommendations given for each cultivar it needs they to be screened for each region, microclimate and growing period.

Key words: Batavia type, Lactuca sativa, Lollo type, High tunnel, November transplanting.

INTRODUCTION

One of the first fresh vegetables on the market, appearing early in the spring, is lettuce. The lettuce is cool season-hardy crop and develops at a temperature of 5-25°C. The optimal temperature for its growth and development is 16-18°C (Lorenz and Maynard, 1988; Kartalov et al., 2007).

Temperatures above 25° C cause the bolting. (Genkova, 2009) and at a temperature below 5° C growth of plants stops (Cholakov, 2009). Young and hardened plant (stage 7-8-th leaf) can withstand lowering the temperature to -5/ -6°C (Cholakov, 2009; Divina, 2016).

One way to year-round production of salads is their greenhouse production. An alternative to glass-greenhouses are polyethylene tunnel greenhouses without heating (Tüzel and Leonardi, 2009). They are economically viable to maintain and produce quality produce (Wells and Loy, 1993).

Salad is one of the first crops grown in a polythene greenhouse, along with warm-season tomatoes and cucumbers, to get off-season production (Lamont, 2005). In the US, the UK,

Belgium and Germany lettuce rank as one of the main crops for cultivation in plastic tunnel greenhouses (Lamont, 2009).

The factors that affect the quality of lettuce are the growing season, the weather conditions and the variety (Koudela and Petříková, 2008). High tunnels protect salads from the unfavorable weather conditions encountered in their outdoor cultivation, thus affecting the time of harvesting, increasing the yield and quality of the produce, and thus these facilities are an alternative for creating early planting of lettuces (Santos et al., 2009; Wallace et al., 2012).

It has been established that the salad growing season influences more on the yield and quality of the produce than the composition of the nutrient solution whose effect is not so well expressed (Fallovo et al., 2009). Date of planting also has a significant impact on yield (Sharma et al., 2009). In the winter production of leafy vegetables and the earlier date of planting, the length of the growing season is not reduced until the harvest, however seedling before the fall of the low winter temperatures and the occurrence of winter frosts leads to greater plants in the spring (Borrelli et al., 2013). Lebeda et al. (2007) describe seven *Lactuca* sativa morphotypes, which cover seven main groups of varieties (including oil-bearing plants) that differ phenotypically (by Kristkova et al., 2008). In the Mediterranean region (Spain, Italy), as well as in the Middle East and North Africa, the main type is Rommaine (Cos) lettuce, in its different shapes and colors. In Northern Europe, both Cos lettuce and Batavia are popular. Stalk (asparagus) lettuce remains important in Egypt, the Middle East and China. All except iceberg found in red and green color of leaves (Ryder, 2002).

Two of the widespread types for Northern and Central Europe, which also enter in Bulgaria, are the Batavia and Lolo.

Type Batavia is characterized by open to strong generally medium thick, rather heading: blistered leaves, predominately strongly vellowish or medium green; leaf margin with weak to strong undulation (UPOV, 2017). In cold conditions not always have a clear position (DUS Test, 2016). It produces moderately dense heads with a crunchy texture and intermediate between iceberg and loose leaf types. Varieties are in red or green color (Divina, 2016). Lebeda et al. (2007) refers Batavia type to Crisphead lettuce (var. capitata L. nidus jäggeri Helm), together with Eissalat и Iceberg type (by Křístková et al., 2008)

Lollo type - it is non-heading; thin leaves with strongly undulated leaf margin. The plant as a whole shows mainly the undulating leaf margins. In general, strongly blistered leaves, blisters are rather small (UPOV, 2017). Forms tender leaves that are delicate and mildly flavored. Varieties come in green and red and green or purple color (Divina, 2016). Lolo type refers to Cutting lettuce (var. *acephala* Alef., syn. var. *secalina* Alef., syn. var. *crispa* L.) and this morphotype is extremely heterogeneous (Křístková et al., 2008).

In order for varieties to reveal their full potential and productivity, they need to be screened to check their adaptation in a given area. This should be done locally, across a broad range of contrasting environments to define and identify the most stable and well adapted varieties for a certain period of vegetation and environment (Dufault et al., 2006). Proper selection of varieties makes it possible to avoid bolting when growing at higher temperatures (Rader and Karlsson, 2006).

The aim of our study was to test and compare some of the offered lettuce cultivars in unheated polyethylene greenhouses (high tunnel) for the winter-spring growing season as November transplanting.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The field experiment was conducted during 2015-2016 at the experimental field (42° 7' N, 23° 43' E and 552 m above sea level) of the University of Forestry, Sofia, Bulgaria. The soil type is fluvisol, slightly stony and slightly acidic ($pH_{(H2O)}$ 6.2). For the purpose of the experiment was used unheated polyethylene greenhouse (high tunnel) covered with a standard transparent strengthen and UV stabilized polyethylene.

Lettuce cultivars: They were selected and tested 19 cultivars of salads, 13 of them are Dutch, three Swiss, two Italian and one French. Selected cultivars refer to two types: Batavia and Lollo (16 are Batavia type, 3 are Lollo type). Of these, six are intended for growing outdoors. Origin, type of lettuce cultivars and recommended season and growing conditions are described in Table 1.

Seedlings were planted in the second ten days of November. The period of transplantation in the polyethylene tunnel was determined in order to use the final moment for planting in this type of cultivation facility for the Sofia region, in line with the ongoing climate change. The date of planting was 12.11.2015, which was fixed according to the weather conditions and the medium-term forecast for the month.

They were used previously produced seedlings and lettuces were grown on a flat surface, in a row, with a plant spacing of 25 cm. The experiment was performed in a blocking method with four replications, with 18 plants for each replication per cultivar. In the polyethylene greenhouse was used drip irrigation and all care during growing period were the same for all variants.

Table 1. Origin			

Variants No.	Cultivars	Origin	Туре	Season	Conditions
1.	Maritima	Netherland	Batavia	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor
				All year round	indoor
2.	Funride	Switzerland	Batavia	Spring-Summer-Autumn For summer cultivation	outdoor
3.	Kriska	Italy	Lollo Bionda	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor
				Autumn-Winter	indoor
4.	Florine	France	Batavia	Spring-Summer;Autumn-Winter	outdoor indoor
5.	Funtasia	Switzerland	Batavia	All year round without high and low temp	outdoor
6.	Noisette	Netherland	Batavia	All year round	outdoor indoor
7.	Malice	Netherland	Batavia	Spring/Autumn	outdoor
				Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor
8.	Fuzila	Netherland	Batavia	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor
9.	Satine	Netherland	Lollo Rossa	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor
10.	Fanela	Netherland	Batavia	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor
11.	Sementel	Netherland	Batavia	Autumn-Winter-Spring	outdoor indoor
12.	Frisady	Netherland	Batavia	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor
	-			All year round	indoor
13.	Donertie	Netherland	Batavia	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor
14.	Jazzie	Netherland	Batavia	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor
15.	Aquarel	Netherland	Batavia	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor
16.	Isi 45194	Italy	Lollo Bionda	Autumn-Winter-Spring	outdoor indoor
17.	Funfix	Switzerland	Batavia	Autumn-Winter-Spring outdoo	
18.	Ostralie	Netherland	Batavia	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor
19.	Hettie	Netherland	Batavia	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor

During the growing period were conducted several plant surveys to account the percentage of rooted as well as the percentage of died plants until the time of harvesting.

Harvesting began in the second ten days of March and continued until the first ten days of April. During the harvesting were measured the plant diameter and the average weight per plant. The collected data were analyzed by ANOVA and were expressed as mean \pm standard deviations. Post hoc analyses were conducted using Fisher's protected LSD test.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

When growing lettuces during the winter season, the period of planting seedlings and weather conditions it is important.

Generally months covering the experimental period (November '15 - April '16) were warmer compared to the average monthly temperatures in the 30-year period, reflecting global warming (Table 2).

From the time of planting until the end of November average daily temperatures were favorable for rooting of seedlings, considering that in unheated greenhouses they were better than outside.

It was found that at night the temperatures in the high tunnels are only 1 or 2°C higher than outdoor temperatures, while daytime temperatures are 10°C higher due to daytime solar radiation (Gent, 2002).

In December the outside temperature dropped, and in the middle of the month irrigation was stopped, thus the plants were prepared for wintering.

Extremely low outdoor temperatures were not recorded during this month, except for 3 days of the month (below -5° C), as in the two days are measured temperatures around the critical minimum for the lettuces in the early period of their development (-5° C), and at the last day of the month is measured at a temperature of -11° C.

January was the month with a negative average temperature, it is the only month with a lower temperature compared to '30 period. During this period the plants were not watered and were not covered with additional plant protection films. From the end of December to the end of January, temperatures were below the freezing temperature of lettuces.

Months	Anomaly compared	Μ	Ionthly tempera (t °C)	ture	Extreme monthly temperatures (number of days)				
	to 30-year period	Average montly	Average minimum	Average maximum					
	t °C	M±SD	M±SD	M±SD	below -5 °C	-5/+5 °C	+16/+18 °C	+18/+25 °C	above +25 °C
November '15	+3.7	8.7±4.1	3.6±4.4	14.7±5.1	0	21	9	8	0
December '15	+1.5	2.1±3.3	-1.1±3.2	6.3±4.1	3	27	0	0	0
January '16	-0.4	-0.9±6.5	-4.8±6.9	3.8±7.1	13	18	1	0	0
February '16	+6.6	7.5±4.3	2.8±3.8	13.0±5.3	0	25	2	7	0
March '16	+1.8	7.1±3.0	2.3±3.0	12.6±4.8	0	25	1	5	0
April '16	+3.4	13.9±3.7	7.3±3.9	21.0±4.9	0	8	4	14	8

Table 2. Average monthly, average minimum, average maximum and extreme monthly temperatures during the experimental period

These low temperatures were the main limit for winter growth, which is confirming the findings of Gent (2002).

February was warm, daily temperatures triggered visible plant growth and irrigation was restored. Since mid-March, lettuces in the polyethylene greenhouse had reached the stage of harvest.

During the growing period was carried out periodic monitoring of the number of died plants. The first observation was at the beginning of December, three weeks after the seedlings were planted, to check the percentage of the rooted plants and their condition for wintering. 100% of rooting of all plants was reported (Table 3).

Table 3. Amount of rooted and survived after wintering plants (%)

	Cultivars	Amount of plants (%)				
No		2015	2016			
		04.12.	08.02.	11.03.	08.04.	
1.	Maritima	100	99	53	49	
2.	Funride	100	97	68	68	
3.	Kriska	100	94	61	61	
4.	Florine	100	88	69	69	
5.	Funtasia	100	79	25	8	
6.	Noisette	100	89	50	31	
7.	Malice	100	92	57	53	
8.	Fuzila	100	89	4	0	
9.	Satine	100	86	81	81	
10.	Fanela	100	75	43	42	
11.	Sementel	100	100	53	51	
12.	Frisady	100	90	47	47	
13.	Donertie	100	97	88	86	
14.	Jazzie	100	93	68	51	
15.	Aquarel	100	93	40	32	
16.	Isi 45194	100	94	92	92	
17.	Funfix	100	79	21	15	
18.	Ostralie	100	86	64	64	
19.	Hettie	100	100	75	75	

At the end of January, sunny weather was established and daily temperatures started to rise sharply (about 11-15°C), and at the beginning of February they reached around and above the optimum for the growing of lettuces (up to 18.8°C) and plants apparently began to grow and develop.

At the end of the first ten days of February, the second monitoring of the number of plants in the greenhouse was made to determine how many of them survived during the low temperatures in January. They were made two more monitoring in the polyethylene greenhouse - in March and April.

In February at three of tested in the polyethylene greenhouse lettuce cultivars - *Funtasia, Funfix* and *Fanela*, the number of plants has fallen below 80%, while variety *Fanela* reported a 25% death of plants. In March with less than 50% of plants were six cultivars, and in April the total number of cultivars with less than 50% plants were 8.

In descending order (from the most failed, to the least) these eight varieties rank as follows: *Fuzila>Funtasia>Funfix>Noisette>Aquarel>*

Fanela>Frisady>Maritima.

There are significant differences in the amount of plants remaining after their wintering:

F(3, 72) = 37.06 MSE = 307.06 p < .0001 at the .05 alpha level.

The causes of plant dying are complex - the season of cultivation (part of the varieties are not suitable for growing in winter), weather conditions (especially temperature), fungal diseases. Of the eight cultivars with more than 50% of the died plants, five are not recommended to be grown in the winter and are intended for open areas. In three of these losses of fungal diseases have been less than 10% and

only *Fuzila* has a high percentage (36%) loss from fungal diseases (Table 4). Attention was also paid to the *Funride*, which, although according to its description is intended for outdoor production during the favorable months of the year (spring-summer-autumn), survived successfully in a polythene greenhouse and losses were 32%.

 Table 4. Recommended growing periods and conditions for the cultivation of cultivars and the amount of died plants (%)

No.	Cultivars	Recommended for		Died p	lants %
INO.	Cultivars	Season	Conditions	Total	Fungal disease
1.	Maritima	All year round	indoor	51	-
2.	Funride	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor	32	10
3.	Kriska	Autumn-Winter	indoor	39	-
4.	Florine	Spring-Summer;Autumn-Winter	indoor	31	-
5.	Funtasia	Without high and low temp	outdoor	92	4
6.	Noisette	All year round	indoor	69	-
7.	Malice	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	47	6
8.	Fuzila	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor	100	36
9.	Satine	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	19	4
10.	Fanela	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor	58	7
11.	Sementel	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	49	11
12.	Frisady	All year round	indoor	53	-
13.	Donertie	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	14	-
14.	Jazzie	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	49	10
15.	Aquarel	Spring-Summer-Autumn	outdoor	68	8
16.	Isi 45194	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	8	3
17.	Funfix	Autumn-Winter-Spring	outdoor	85	14
18.	Ostralie	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	36	22
19.	Hettie	Autumn-Winter-Spring	indoor	25	-

During the harvesting of the produce, biometric data were collected - diameter and average weight of the plants (Table 5).

There are significant differences in the diameter of the plants F(17, 161)=5.10 MSE = 4.53 p < .0001 at the .05 alpha level, as well as the average weight per plant F(16, 40)=2.97 MSE = 1581.23 p = .002 at the .05 alpha level.

In several cultivars, the plants reached a diameter of between 25-27 cm. In descending order (from the largest diameter to the smaller), they are arranged in the following way:

Fanela>Malice>Hettie>Frisady>Noisette>Isi 45194. Immediately after them come Funride and Kriska, whose diameter is close to 24 cm.

The average weight of a plant varies, depending on the type and cultivars, was from 92 g to over 230 g per plant. The largest weight per plant (220-230 g) had three cultivars that are arranged in descending order in the following way: *Frisady>Fanela>Malice*. Immediately after them was again *Funride*, with 217 g, followed by *Hettie* - 211 g. (Table 5).

No	Cultivar	Plant diameter (cr	m)	Plant weight (g/per plant)	
		M±SD	LSD*	M±SD	LSD*
1	Maritima	23.33±1.72	cdefg	151±34	C D
2	Funride	23.90±3.48	bcdef	217±19	A B
3	Kriska	23.83±2.48	c d e f	204±32	A B C
4	Florine	22.25±1.66	fgh	194±48	A B C
5	Funtasia	20.33±4.51	h	0,00	
6	Noisette	24.71±1.80	bcde	183±24	A B C
7	Malice	25.58±1.93	a b	226±64	A B
8	Fuzila	0		0	
9	Satine	22.00±1.54	g h	94±20	D
10	Fanela	27.33±3.20	a	228±67	A B
11	Sementel	22.92±2.39	e f g h	185±41	A B C

No	Cultivar	Plant diameter (cr	n)	Plant weight (g/per plant)	
	Cultivar	M±SD	M±SD	M±SD	
12	Frisady	24.91±1.64	bcd	231±34	А
13	Donertie	22.08±1.68	g h	163±17	B C
14	Jazzie	23.11±1.45	defgh	204±64	АВС
15	Aquarel	22.50±0.97	fgh	164±13	B C
16	Isi 45194	24.58±2.23	bcde	153±38	С
17	Funfix	22.40±1.67	defgh	150±0	B C D
18	Ostralie	22.22±2.44	fgh	188±38	A B C
19	Hettie	25.10±1.52	b c	211±46	A B

*Means within a column followed by the same letter do not differ significantly based on Fisher's LSD post-hoc analyses at p<.05.

CONCLUSIONS

By making a comprehensive analysis of the results in individual cultivars can say several of them, which are for indoor cultivation, stand out: from type Batavia are *Hettie, Frisady, Malice, Jazzie, Florine, Sementel, Donertie. Cultivars Frisady, Malice, Jazzie* and *Sementel* are slightly more sensitive to extreme temperatures, which is expressed in a greater variation in the average weight per plant in *Malice* and *Jazzie*.

All three varieties of type Lolo showed very good results: *Kriska, Isi 45194* and *Satine*, as the last one is the type Lollo Rosso and had a very gentle and tender leaves, which affected the average weight per plant. The *Kriska* cultivar was slightly more sensitive to extreme temperatures than the other two but had a higher average weight per plant than the other two Lolo type cultivars.

Two of the cultivars, type of Batavia, which are intended for outdoor cultivation, also showed very good results when growing indoors in winter: *Funride* and *Fanela*, but the second one was a little more sensitive to extreme temperatures.

Regardless of the recommendations given in the cultivar descriptions, it is necessary to screen the offered cultivars, for each region, microclimate and growing period, which confirms the conclusions of the Dufault et al. (2006) and Maynard (2014)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research work was funded by Project \mathbb{N} 17/19.01.2016: "Response to abiotic stress factors for different Salads (*Lactuca sativa* L.) var. *romana* and var. *capitata* in the Sofia field.", to the Research Sector of the University of Forestry.

REFERENCES

- Borrelli, K., Koenig, R. T., Jaeckel, B. M., Miles, C. A. (2013): Yield of leafy greens in high tunnel winter production in the Northwest United States. *HortScience*, 48(2), 183-188.
- Cholakov, D. T. (2009): Vegetable production Plovdiv Academic Publishing House of the Agrarian University (*in Bulgarian*)
- Divina C. J. (2016). Lettuce production guide Department of Agriculture, burreau of plant industry. GOVPH
- Dufault, R. J., Ward, B., Hassell, R. L. (2006): Planting date and romaine lettuce cultivar affect quality and productivity. *HortScience*, 41(3), 640-645.
- DUS (2016) Test for Lettuce Lactuca sativa L. CALIBRATION MANUAL Harmonized with Naktuinbouw and NCSS(/NARO) Established in December 26, Comply with UPOV TG/13/10 Rev. 2
- Fallovo, C., Rouphael, Y., Cardarelli, M., Rea, E., Battistelli, A., Colla, G. (2009): Yield and quality of leafy lettuce in response to nutrient solution composition and growing season. J. Agric. Food Environ, 7, 456-462.
- Genkova, I. (2009). Intensive vegetable production. Sofia (in Bulgarian).
- Gent, M. P. N. (2002). Growth and composition of salad greens as affected by organic compared to nitrate fertilizer and by environment in high tunnels. *Journal* of plant Nutrition, 25(5), 981-998.
- Kartalov, P. I., Doykova, M. P., Boshnakov, P. (2007): Vegetable production with seed production. Sofia: Videnov and son. *(in Bulgarian)*
- Koudela, M., Petříková, K. (2008): Nutrients content and yield in selected cultivars of leaf lettuce (Lactuca sativa L. var. crispa). *Horticultural Science*, 35(3), 99-106.
- Kristkova, E., Dolezalova, I., Lebeda, A., Vinter, V., Novotná, A. (2008). Description of morphological characters of lettuce (*Lactuca sativa* L.) genetic resources. *Hortic Sci*, 35(3), 113-129.
- Lamont, W. J. (2005). Plastics: Modifying the microclimate for the production of vegetable crops. *HortTechnology*, 15(3), 477-481.
- Lamont, W. J. (2009). Overview of the use of high tunnels worldwide. *HortTechnology*, *19*(1), 25-29.
- Lebeda A., Ryder E.J., Grube R., DoleŽalovÁ I., KŘÍstkovÁ E., 2007. Lettuce (Asteraceae; Lactuca spp.). In: SINGH R.J. (ed.), Genetic Resources, Chromosome Engineering, and Crop Improvement,

Vol. 3, Vegetable Crops. Boca Raton, CRC Press, Tailor and Francis Group: 377–472.

- Lorenz, O.A., Maynard, D.M. (1988). *Knott's handbook* for vegetable growers. John Wiley and Sons, New York.
- Maynard, E. (2014). Lettuce Cultivar Observation Trial— 2013. Midwest Vegetable Trial Report for 2013.
- Rader, H. B., Karlsson, M. G. (2006). Northern field production of leaf and romaine lettuce using a high tunnel. *HortTechnology*, 16(4), 649-654.
- Ryder, E. J. (2002). The new salad crop revolution. *Trends* in new crops and new uses. ASHS Press, Alexandria, VA, 408-412.
- Santos Filho, B. G., Lobato, A. K. S., Silva, R. B., Schimidt, D., Costa, R. C. L., Alves, G. A. R., Neto, C. O. (2009). Growth of lettuce (*Lactuca sativa* L.) in protected cultivation and open field. *Journal of Applied Sciences Research*, 5(5), 529-533.
- Sharma, P. C. D., Rahman, M. M., Mollah, M. A. H., Islam, M. S. (2009). Influence of method and date of

planting on the production of lettuce. *Bangladesh Journal of Agricultural Research*, 34(1), 75-80.

- Tüzel, Y., Leonardi C. (2009). Protected Cultivation in Mediterranean Region: Trends and Needs Ege Üniv. Ziraat Fak. Derg., 46 (3): 215-223
- Wallace, R. W., Wszelaki, A. L., Miles, C. A., Cowan, J. S., Martin, J., Roozen, J., Gundersen, B., Inglis, D. A. (2012). Lettuce yield and quality when grown in high tunnel and open-field production systems under three diverse climates. *HortTechnology*, 22(5), 659-668.
- Wells, O. S., Loy, J. B. (1993). Rowcovers and high tunnels enhance crop production in the northeastern United States. *HortTechnology*, 3(1), 92-95.
- Wien, H. C. (2009). Microenvironmental variations within the high tunnel. *HortScience*, 44(2), 235-238.
- UPOV (2017) Lettuce Guidelines for the Conduct of Tests for Distinctness, Uniformity and Stability International Union for the Protection of New Varieties of Plants, Geneva TG/13/11 Original: English, date: 2017-04-05